

## Guided Pathways: What does the research say?

*Created for the South Central Coast Regional Consortium*

### FOUR PILLARS OF GUIDED PATHWAYS



**Pillar 1: Clarifying the path:** How can the college create clear curricular pathways to further education and employment?

**Pillar 2: Entering the path:** How can the college help students choose and enter their pathway?

**Pillar 3: Staying on the path:** How can the college help student stay on their path?

**Pillar 4: Ensuring Learning:** How can the college ensure that learning is happening with intentional outcomes?

#### Guided pathways momentum points/ benchmarks

- Enrollment in college-level math and English in first year
- Completion of 15+ units by end of first semester
- Completion of 30+ units by end of first year
- Completion of 60+ units at time of degree completion

### **Areas of inquiry – CA State Self-Assessment**

1. College data – what are core issues with student progress/ equity gaps?
2. Metrics in place to measure student success improvement. Data disaggregated by metrics.
3. How to integrate guided pathways planning with SSSP, BSI/BSSOT, Student Equity, Strong Workforce & other planning groups such as EdCAP, Student Success Committee etc.
4. Cross-functional team formation with faculty, staff, administrators and students for communication and decision-making.
5. Coordination between K12, 4-year institutions and industry partners to align pipeline.
6. Programs of study have been clustered into broad interest areas with input from faculty, staff and students. Foundation/survey/gateway courses exist.
7. Strategies have been put in place to ensure more students pass college/transfer-level English and math within a year of enrollment; large increases can be seen.
8. Teams of instructional & counseling faculty have mapped course sequences; transfer/ major requirements and labor market information were used to develop course sequences; default maps/ milestones for each program exist. Class schedules are designed to meet student demand & allow them to complete their programs of study in a timely manner.
9. Proactive supports are provided to most students; the college can track student progress; mechanisms are in place to help students who fall off track; ongoing collaboration on student support improvements takes place.
10. The college has technology tools in place to support academic planning, placement, advising, tracking, completion outcomes, career counseling including employment & salary information, and transfer/ Bachelor's attainment data. College has capacity for timely enrollment management.

11. Professional development for faculty on: learning outcomes, student referral, student customer service, leadership capacity-building, student data analysis, technology training.
12. Regular review of SLOs, PLOs, GELOs, ILOs.
13. Attainment of SLOs made available to students and faculty.
14. Student have access to contextualized learning: projects, internships, clinical placements, service learning, study abroad, other active learning.

## **What does the research say?**

### **Student voices (Career Ladders Project)**

- The majority said that sampling various courses was not helpful to them
- Don't understand which majors lead to which careers/ salaries
- Unaware of which courses fulfil multiple requirements
- Want an introductory career exploration course (GFSF)
- Not clear on course requirements – when they were clear, didn't enroll in unnecessary classes
- Waitlist process frustrating – limited spots in classes they need
- Courses not offered during semester they need them
- Classes conflict with work schedules (60% of students P/T)
- Counselors not effective in helping with career exploration, choosing a major, or understanding content of specific courses
- Lack of knowledge about careers and link to majors
- Undeclared students want to do career assessments as they enter college
- Wanted peer-to-peer connections such as study groups by major
- Like learning communities

Online resource for student focus groups including questions:

<http://www.careerladdersproject.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/08/Bringing-Student-Voices-to-Guided-Pathways-Inquiry-and-Design.pdf>

## Bakersfield College

**Pillar 1: Clarifying the path:** How can the college create clear curricular pathways to further education and employment?

Articulation/Dual enrollment • Early, abbreviated educational planning • Associate Degrees for Transfer and the College Promise • Meta-majors as organizing tool

**Pillar 2: Entering the path:** How can the college help students choose and enter their pathway?

Early (and frequent) engagement • Matriculation steps in every feeder high school • One-day registration events • Expanding online services • Summer Bridge

**Pillar 3: Staying on the path:** How can the college help student stay on their path?

• Acceleration • Completion Coaching • Academic Support Services • Technology • Institutional Effectiveness

**Pillar 4: Ensuring Learning:** How can the college ensure that learning is happening with intentional outcomes?

Assessment of Learning Outcomes • Co-curricular learning experiences

## Early insights from AACC Pathways colleges

- Colleges work with high school students to help them explore career and college interests and prepare them to enter a program of study in college
- Create a climate for change, engage and enable the whole organization, implement & sustain change
- Programs need to lead to family-supporting jobs in demand
- Assess why low-enrollment classes are being offered
- Create “roadmaps” of all programs
- Math courses aligned with programs of study
- Shift from algebra to quantitative reasoning
- All program maps include highly recommended GE courses
- Contextualized learning added to each pathway: internships, service learning
- Define process for updating maps – they are dynamic
- Counseling should help student explore interests and goals and develop a plan to realize them, instead of selecting courses for the upcoming semester
- Scripts with questions for counselors to ask students before classes start: interests, strengths
- College/ transfer level English and math, plus core introductory classes should be completed year one
- FYE courses for all – career exploration, career assessments, meta-major exposure (in HS)
- Accelerated developmental math and English/ co-req.
- Counselors cross-trained on career advising
- Students can change pathways, but need to consult with a counselor to do so

- Students can only be undecided for 1 semester
- Parents invited to orientation
- Counselors help them create an education, career and financial plan
- Writing course 1<sup>st</sup> semester, math 2<sup>nd</sup>
- Showcase meta-majors – faculty recruit new students
- Mandatory tutoring in gateway classes
- “Pre-guided pathways” curriculum in high schools to explain meta-majors
- Sections scheduled when students need them
- Embedded counselors in meta-majors plus success coaches
- All counselors certified as career development facilitators
- Mandatory milestone check-ups for students at 25%, 50% and 75% program completion
- Case management – students need to be contacted before they enroll, and be seen in person 3 times in 1<sup>st</sup> semester, and be contacted 3 times by text/ phone or email
- Financial aid director trained all counselors on such topics as satisfactory academic progress
- Students need to have contact with faculty and employers in their field of interest
- Off-plan alerts to students and counselors
- Pre-registration of students prior to semester based on program plans
- “15 to finish”
- Annual course schedule
- Math competencies broken down into algebra, stats, quantitative reasoning and finite math, and aligned with major program pathways
- Executive team sets vision and supports ideas generated by the people working directly with the students
- Hiring redesign – how do faculty/administrators support 13 student success beliefs?
- Department chairs no longer teach - they focus on improving pedagogy, program improvement and faculty development
- Only 1 developmental education level exists
- Study tours to other colleges to observe best practices
- College bought the “Redesigning America’s Community Colleges” book for everyone
- Produce a report showing enrollments by program and number of credits taken by AA/AS degree graduates
- Produce data on how many students leave the college in good standing and with no credential
- Intervention with “nursing” students who would not make it into program
- “We are becoming a pathways college”
- Ensure faculty will be able to maintain full course loads
- Have counselors create maps and then give them to faculty to review
- Mapping roles: administrators – student success rates across sections/ programs; faculty – industry requirements, student success rates by course, writing & math requirements, field experience opportunities; counselors – gateway courses, GE requirements; GE faculty/ deans – GE appropriate for various programs.
- Faculty can feel threatened – leaders need to support with training & PD
- “Framework Fridays” – set-aside time for faculty & student services staff can work on mapping
- Provide change management training

- Need for ongoing communication
- Engage faculty: focus on supporting students' upward mobility & social justice
- Developmental instructors teach co-req. classes
- Updating of maps incorporated into program review process
- Contiguous time-block scheduling
- Proactively identify students with weak skills/ those not showing up for class/ not doing assignments & provide support/ counseling
- Identify gateway courses for meta-majors such as Psych 101, anatomy & physiology, biology 101 etc. and allocate resources the same way as for math & English
- Abolish late registration
- Multiple types of advising
- Predictive analytic questions to understand strengths and challenges prior to student taking classes
- Work groups for: program mapping; career communities (exploratory/ meta-majors); student progress tracking/ timely support; predictable semester/program schedules; contextualized instruction opportunities; bridges to college for high school students/ adult learners; seamless transfer opportunities; dual admission/ guaranteed transfer opportunities for transfer students
- How many units a semester are your students successfully completing?

#### **Davis Jenkins recommendations**

- Develop default programs of study
- Require students to choose from broad program streams rather than be "undecided"
- Make someone responsible for transition of students from K12 to community college
- Make sure students who qualify for help know, and get it
- Need shared case management system
- Academic progress checks need to reflect program completion
- Student success classes have too many topics
- Student success classes need to be linked to meta-majors
- Need a specialized counselor for major changers
- Link for enrollment management between HS and college
- Improved pedagogy – non-cognitive skills teaching versus content transmission
- Faculty need new job descriptions focused on improving student success
- Pool teaching resources within/ across departments
- Community colleges will need to do outreach/ marketing on meta-majors
- Boot camps not effective for remedial education
- Faculty need to lead program mapping
- Professional development by in-house faculty
- Cost needs to be calculated by time to completion, not cost per student per semester
- Progress, not persistence
- Develop college know-how
- Address the conflicting demands of family, work & college

### **Kalsbeek/ Kuh recommendations**

- Focus on the many, not the few – don't focus on statistical outliers
- Student services have fragmented roles (need for secret shopper!)
- Data should focus on academic performance in 1<sup>st</sup> year and credit accumulation in a pathway
- Shift from focus on culture to focus on structural elements: high-risk courses and curricula, not high-risk students
- Register once in a pathway instead of multiple times
- K12 needs info on how their students perform in college to strengthen their curriculum
- Provide short-term emergency loans for textbooks
- Shift from teaching to ensuring learning is happening
- Fix processes, don't focus on activities
- Pay attention to structural elements, not culture: focus on policies & structures that hinder/ facilitate student success, not interventions to minimize departures
- Have community college counselors on-site at high schools

### **Goldrick-Rab recommendations**

- The benefits of strong high school preparation are greater for socioeconomically disadvantaged students
- First-gen students are less likely to receive high-quality information about financial aid opportunities, and, in turn, are less likely to apply to college or file the FAFSA
- Students from socioeconomically disadvantaged family backgrounds do not possess a clear sense of how to navigate the college, and they make ineffective choices when confronted with multiple options
- Student success "centers" for students on probation
- Early assessment programs reduce the chances of students needing English/ math remediation when they enroll
- Emergency financial aid

### **Guided pathways outcomes**

- Increases in first- to second-term retention rates
- Decreases in numbers of students in poor academic standing
- Increases in A, B and C grades
- Decreases in D, F, W and I grades
- Lower course repetition rates
- Higher performance in next course in the sequence

### **Community College Research Center**

- Redirect PD funding into training, facilitation, and support for pathways mapping teams
- Year 1: make the case for change to faculty & staff; review current practices; share data (how many students leave after 1 or 2 semesters; how many take courses that do not make up a program of study; how many transfer without an associate degree); conduct focus groups with students on their experience choosing a program of study; carry out exercises with faculty & staff on navigating program requirements through a student's eyes; identify who should be involved in discussions about improvements in different areas.
- Year 2: map the programs (faculty & counselors); rethink student advising; progress monitoring, and student supports; review committee structures, policies for employee hiring & performance reviews, program review processes, institutional research activities; extensive faculty training on early alerts, technology tools etc.
- Year 3: Large-scale implementation of program maps and redesigned intake & advising systems; develop strong formative evaluation process.
- Years 4 & 5: complete large-scale implementation; improve effectiveness of guided pathways; increase engagement through professional development, training & broad-based communication.
- Hire more advisors

### **Rob Johnstone (National Center for Inquiry & Improvement) recommendations**

- Shift the focus of student choice from picking courses to selecting programs
- Integrate career planning at the beginning of their higher ed. experience
- There will be vastly increased enrollments downstream if these structural redesigns work
- Have faculty shortlist GE options that would be best for students that graduate in their discipline
- Address the middle 70% of the student population, where all the leverage lives
- 80% of students want to transfer
- Link pathways to jobs/ salaries
- It should take a part-time student approx. 7-10 semesters to complete
- Identify foundational courses that will position students to pursue multiple related programs of study
- If students persist in staying off-path, they may need to change programs areas
- Guided pathway development takes approx. 12 - 20 hours per pathway
- Use existing campus structures to pursue change, rather than new committees that potentially duplicate/ drain current groups
- Facilitate registration for a year with a single code
- Create a solid project plan on all 4 domains
- Create career communities with common first semesters

## Strengthening Student Success Conference Fall 2017

- Look at units attempted as well as earned
- State will provide a field guide, online learning, leadership development & facilitation teams
- If it takes a student 4 years to complete an AS, it costs them \$15,200 more than someone who completes in 2 years, and they earn \$33,500 less than someone who graduated in 2 years
- After sharing the pathways data with colleagues, ask “Who wants to do something about this?”
- 50% of all children in California have a foreign-born parent
- 1 out of 5 children have one or both parents that are undocumented
- Student panel “Why we drop out” - strategies for improving early retention
- Create professional development equity outcomes: report implementation of specific student learning strategies and assess/ reflect upon the effectiveness of those strategies
- Equity: everybody gets a sweater in their size; equality: everybody gets a large sweater. Educators: What are the ways you can give everyone their own size sweater in class? How are your teaching practices changing?
- Integrated planning: Step 1 local inquiry process. Step 2 inventory of existing initiatives. Step 3 build on existing communication channels and create new ones to ensure inclusivity
- Data: how many units have students accrued when they complete?
- “Getting the college ready for students”
- Sessions with department chairs to allow them to express their concerns
- Use common definitions from SSSP, Equity, Basic Skills and SWP
- Integrate budgets to avoid duplication
- Stay out of “match jail” and “compliance jail” – bring in the business operations team when integrating budgets
- Professional development for pedagogical teaching/ learning
- Pair educators up to visit each other’s classes – can be different disciplines
- Meta-major: a student’s interests as a starting point
- Develop infrastructure for guided pathways: Skyline College has: exploratory course inquiry team, foundation (affective domain) work team, GE redesign inquiry team, high impact practices inquiry team, meta-majors work team, student support services work team, undeclared student experience inquiry team  
[http://skylinecollege.edu/metamajors/assets/documents/SkylineCollege\\_Toolkit.pdf](http://skylinecollege.edu/metamajors/assets/documents/SkylineCollege_Toolkit.pdf)
- Develop roles, goals and guidelines: logistics and communication
- 3 FTEs split between 5 leads. Include CEOs.
- Design process: how do we know that we are making the right decisions? le for meta-majors: focus on student perception, efficiency for students, shared ways of knowing, keep an open mind
- Decision-making process: inventory of necessary stakeholders to take a plan to implementation
- Communication process: different audiences on campus require different messaging. How often?
- Clean up certificates/ degrees BEFORE program mapping. What needs updating? Start with clean data for sequencing.
- Arrange degrees and certificates with courses in common to cluster into meta-majors (social graphing)

- Student voices: Which questions? How many students? Which students? Who asks questions?
- Student questions: How do you choose a career/ major? How do you choose courses each semester? Which supports are helpful/ would be helpful for you?
- Data: How many students applied? How many FAFSAs without students? How many students without FAFSAs? How many students on waitlists? How many students clicked on a waitlist and couldn't get in?
- System for program maps to be pulled up side-by-side with student ed. plans (counselors)
- Look at data around student "choke points": assessment/ placement, college entry, basic skills, tutoring, program choice, pre-req. completion, program entry, program progress, program completion, transfer/ enter workforce – from student perspective
- Guided pathways focus on structure and scheduling
- Guided pathways provide administrative support to faculty-driven reforms
- Guided pathways help students make informed choices
- Have faculty identify buckets and then do same activity with students
- Put programs in more than one bucket
- Have faculty sequence their courses across 4 semesters
- Data: students who start at lowest level and progress through to highest in math/ English
- What happens for students below transfer level? Undecided students?
- Have discipline faculty sit with English/ math faculty – what kind of English/ math do students need in your profession/ classes?
- How to get grades from high school if students are applying in April?
- Develop Board policy on texting students
- Text students who qualify for FAFSA that didn't enroll (Mt. Sac had 220 extra students sign up)
- Tag people for teams who are skeptics so that they ask the hard questions
- 1<sup>st</sup> priority – engagement & sense of urgency – why do we need Guided Pathways?
- Challenges – where/ when can teams meet? Need to give up some other meetings
- Data: where are students after 1 year?
- Revamped onboarding process: all matriculation including advising takes place at the high school (Reedley College)
- "What do we do well and how can we do it at scale?"
- Mathjam – brush-up before placement
- Disconnect between classes available and what counselors are telling them to take
- Need to address waitlists and students who can't get onto waitlists
- Goal – students successfully complete college/ transfer level English and math within 1<sup>st</sup> year
- Abolish "undeclared" – provide students with an activity to narrow down their bucket choice
- It's not about the major – it's about the career area
- Waitlists are not ok – it means the college is not delivering what students want/ need
- Extract scheduling data from student ed. plans, not program chairs (Sierra College added nearly 2,000 extra seats in biology, chemistry, math and communication studies)
- Expand Dual Enrollment
- Abolish email blasts
- Invest in change management training
- Add LMI to interest area web pages

- Data: low completion rate for number of units in 1<sup>st</sup> semester (particularly P/T students)
- % students that complete transfer level English & math, disaggregated by populations
- Come up with a problem statement to become focused and inclusive ie only 18% of our students complete an Associate's degree and transfer within 3 years, and those students are disproportionately impacted
- Facilitate teaching from an equity perspective
- Do not give students an information dump at orientation – 2.5 hours is too much!
- Don't play student ping-pong – sending them to different offices for different things
- What are the top searches on your website? Does your information provided help with what students are looking for?
- Only 30% of students check email. Why not text them instead?
- We construct narratives of what we think students need – let their voices be heard
- Students are seeking greater clarity and more help entering pathways
- How can we link career exploration and decision-making and our college programs with high school and middle school?
- Intentional hiring for equity, social justice and effective pedagogy can accelerate the impact of student success in guided pathways
- Guided pathways is to the student what GPS is to the driver

## References

- Bailey, T., Jaggars, S., & Jenkins, D. (2015). *Redesigning America's community colleges: A clearer path to student success*. Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press.
- Bakersfield College Guided Pathways. Retrieved from <https://www.bakersfieldcollege.edu/caguidedpathways>
- Community College Research Center. *What we know about Guided Pathways*. Retrieved from <https://ccrc.tc.columbia.edu/publications/what-we-know-about-guided-pathways-packet.html>
- Dadgar, M., Arrillaga, E., Buck, D., Sinclair, B., Fischerhall, C., & Brown, K. (2017). *Bringing Student Voices to Guided Pathways Inquiry and Design*. Retrieved from <http://www.careerladdersproject.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/08/Bringing-Student-Voices-to-Guided-Pathways-Inquiry-and-Design.pdf>
- Goldrick-Rab, S. (2010). *Challenges and opportunities for improving student success*. Review of Educational Research, 80, 3, p.437-469.
- Jenkins, D., Lahr, H., & Fink, J. (2017). *Implementing guided pathways: Early insights from the AACC pathways colleges*. Retrieved from <https://www.caguidedpathways.org/>
- Johnstone, R. (National Center for Inquiry & Improvement). *Guided Pathways Demystified I & II*. Retrieved from <http://ncii-improve.com/publications/>
- Kalsbeek, D. (2013). *Reframing retention strategy for institutional improvement*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Kuh, G. (2013). *Promise in action: examples of institutional success*. In D. Kalsbeek (Ed.), *Reframing retention strategy for institutional improvement* (pp. 81-90). San Francisco: Jossey Bass
- RP Group Strengthening Student Success Conference Fall 2017. Retrieved from 2017 Creating coherent pathways <https://rpgroup.org/Events/Strengthening-Student-Success/Presenter-Past-Resources#4320118-presentation-materials>

*Researched by Karen Miles  
Regional K14 Career Pathways Technical Assistance Provider  
South Central Coast Regional Consortium  
karen.miles@canyons.edu*